NIHR Integrated Academic Training
NIHR Academic Clinical Fellowship (Dental):
Guidance for Recruitment & Appointment

2018
Introduction

1. The Academic Clinical Fellowship (ACF) represents the first substantive phase of integrated clinical and academic specialty training.

2. The ACF phase is aimed at dentists at the start of specialty training, or General Dental Practitioners (GDPs) who wish to develop an academic career.

3. This guidance is intended for NIHR Integrated Academic Training (IAT) Partnerships, comprising Health Education England (HEE) Local Offices (formerly Local Education Training Boards; LETBs), Dental Schools, and NHS Organisations, to support the selection of individuals for NIHR ACFs in dentistry starting on or after 1st April 2018.

4. The primary purpose of an ACF is to provide a clinical and academic training environment for a dentist in the early stages of specialty training to prepare an application for a Training Fellowship leading to a PhD (or equivalent) or, in cases where the applicant has already undertaken a relevant PhD, a postdoctoral fellowship. ACFs are also available to GDPs who wish to pursue an academic career.

5. Applications for a Dental ACF in England will follow the same process for entry into normal specialty training programmes. This document sets out the broad framework regarding the eligibility for ACFs.


Recruitment and the Award of a NTN(a)

7. Recruitment to ACF posts is managed by the relevant HEE Local Office in the IAT Partnerships.

8. The award of a National Training Number (a) ((NTN (a)) will be made to applicants who are successful in the appointment process. Since NTNs are awarded by Postgraduate Deans, the HEE Local Office must lead the appointment process.

9. Applicants must meet the requirements of the clinical person specifications for entry into specialty training and appointment. Panels must ensure that both clinical and academic standards for appointments are met.

10. In the case of GDP ACFs, there is no recognised specialty training programme therefore the award of a NTN(a) will not apply.

UK National Specialty Recruitment

11. For recruitment to ACFs in GDC Specialties using the National Recruitment to Specialty Training Process (for 2018 ACF recruitment this is currently Paediatric Dentistry, Orthodontics, and Restorative Dentistry) ACF applicants deemed appointable at the joint clinical and academic ACF interviews who do not hold an NTN will need to be assessed/interviewed subsequently through the relevant national process for the specialty, during which they must pass the pre-determined “threshold of appointability” in order to be appointed to the ACF.

12. ACF applicants will be ranked on their performance at the ACF interview, not the national clinical interview.
13. For recruitment to all other GDC specialties (and GDP ACF recruitment), NIHR expects that the standards that are exercised for national selection to clinical training posts are applied locally to NIHR ACF appointments.

Advertisement

14. The recruitment round will open on 6th November 2017 and close on 31st March 2019. 2018 ACF posts may not be advertised and closed before the national launch on 6th November. Please note that successful candidates may not take up their post until after 1st April 2018.

15. All ACF posts must be advertised and open for applications for at least 4 weeks.

16. Posts should be advertised as GDC specialty-specific e.g. Oral Surgery or Dental Public Health regardless of the level of entry.

17. Posts can be advertised at a specific entry level or at multiple levels. IAT partnerships will need to make it clear at what level or levels each ACF is being offered.

18. The launch of the 2018 Dental ACF recruitment round will be advertised nationally by the NIHR Trainees Co-ordinating Centre (NIHR TCC). Details of the available posts will be available on the NIHR website (www.nihr.ac.uk/acfs). Potential trainees will be asked to make contact locally via an identified IAT Partnership contact. NIHR TCC will direct ACF applicants to the relevant HEE Local Office websites and Oriel (https://www.oriel.nhs.uk/Web/Vacancies).

19. Organisational partnerships must inform NIHR TCC when they are planning to advertise their posts and provide details of where their adverts will be placed. This should be done via e-mail to iat.management@nihrtcc.org.uk. All posts must be advertised nationally; local advertisements are also allowed should partnerships wish to do so.

20. Successful applicants must take up the post before 31st March 2019, therefore please allow enough time to advertise, shortlist, interview, and where required, allow for notice periods to be given. Please note there will not be any extensions given beyond the 31st March 2019 deadline. Posts that are not filled ahead of 31st March 2019 will be withdrawn.

Eligibility

21. NIHR ACF posts are awarded to IAT partnerships of Dental Schools, HEE Local Offices, and NHS Organisations. HEE Local Offices do not have permission to move any posts from one Dental School to another within the HEE Local Office boundary.

22. NIHR Dental ACFs are available to dentally-qualified candidates entering specialty training or already undertaking specialty training. Candidates (including GDPs) will have completed their Dental Foundation Training and Dental Core Training (or equivalent), as appropriate.

23. NIHR Dental ACF posts are open to:
   a. Specialist Registrars (SpR) or Specialty Registrars (StR) (those currently holding a NTN).
   b. Dentists with specialist/ty experience who meet the entry criteria for entry into specialty training.
   c. GDPs.

24. ACF applicants would not normally be expected to hold a PhD or other higher degree, but applicants may include:
a. BDS/PhD graduates and those with a relevant intercalated PhD obtained during dental undergraduate training (to enable postdoctoral research applications).

b. Dentists who have previously undertaken a relevant PhD may apply to continue postdoctoral research as long as they possess the other entry requirements for the specialty. They will need to show that they have a commitment to academic dentistry.

c. Dental graduates who obtained PhDs prior to dental undergraduate training – their PhD may or may not be considered relevant by the appointment committee.

d. Dental graduates who have previously undertaken a specialty taught or research masters.

25. Please note: Candidates who have already gained a Certificate of Completion of Specialist Training (CCST) cannot be appointed to NIHR Dental ACFs.

Run-through

26. Specialty-specific NIHR ACFs are considered as run-through posts for the duration of the ACF and beyond. Clinical progression is based on the achievement of competencies and satisfactory completion of an Annual Review of Competence Progression (ARCP). Specialty NIHR ACFs are considered to have entered into a programme that will take them through to gaining a CCST.

Additional Information for NIHR GDP ACFs

27. NIHR GDP ACFs are not appointed to a Specialty training programme. Their academic training (25%) will thus be combined with clinical service (75%), as a salaried or self-employed GDP in Primary Care or Community Dental Care.

28. GDPs will be expected to engage in appropriate continuing professional development.

Application

29. The National Application Form on Oriel (https://www.oriel.nhs.uk/Web/Vacancies) should be used for 2018 Dental ACF recruitment.

30. HEE Local Offices should use the 2018 person specifications for the relevant specialty and level of entry and the generic academic person specification (Appendix 2).

31. An academic reference must be provided for applicants applying for ACF posts in addition to clinical references. The structured reference form, for specialty training and academic training programmes, is provided in Appendix 3.

Job Description

32. The job description must be agreed by both the academic and clinical leads involved in the scheme and include the following information, as a minimum:

   a. Job title, level and name of the Specialty;
   b. Duration of the post, and what happens at the end of the post if a candidate is successful or unsuccessful in obtaining a research fellowship;
   c. Hospitals in which training will take place;
   d. Research institution(s) in which training will take place;
   e. Whether day release or block release will be used for protected research time;
   f. Description of the research component of the programme (minimum 250 words);
   g. Description of the clinical training component of the programme (minimum 250 words);
   h. Academic Programme Director name;
   i. Clinical Programme Director name;
j. Programme contact for further information (phone or email);
k. HEE Local Office contact for further information (phone or email);
l. A link to the NIHR website (http://www.nihr.ac.uk/acfs) for further information; and
m. Confirmation that the post attracts a NTN (a) (with the exception of GDP ACFs).

**Shortlisting**

33. Applicants to ACF posts should have their application forms scored against the shortlisting template (Appendix 4). Shortlisted applicants should provide evidence of clinical competency appropriate for the specialty training level of the ACF.

34. Shortlisting must be undertaken by at least one clinician and one academic, both of whom should have received training in fair recruitment and selection and equal opportunities in the last 3 years.

**ACF Interviews**

35. ACF Interviews should last at least thirty minutes.

36. Partnerships should inform NIHR TCC of when interviews will be taking place, as members of TCC staff and the NIHR Dean for Faculty Trainees will be attending randomly selected interviews throughout the year.

37. Applicants will be initially ranked on their academic scores. In the event of joint academic ranking, clinical scoring will be used to order the applicants based on the NIHR ACF recruitment process.

38. The appointment panel should have both clinical and academic representatives that reflect the IAT partnership offering the ACF programme and specialty. It is expected, in addition to the clinical and academic representative, that the panel will include:
   a. The lead of the ACF training programme or their representative;
   b. Additional representation from the relevant academic community, if required;
   c. An independent academic member (wherever possible, from outside the HEE local office boundary);
   d. A lay representative or lay chair.

39. The academic referee’s comments should be available to the appointment panel if required. The recruiter should request paper versions of the academic references if required at the ACF interview.

40. The appointment panel will have the authority to allocate an NTN and successful appointees (with the exception of GDP ACF appointees) will be given an NTN (a), at entry.

41. The appointment panel members should have received training in fair recruitment and selection and equal opportunities (equality and diversity training) in the last 3 years.

**ACF Interview Selection Criteria**

42. The criteria at interview for assessing candidates should be derived directly from the person specification, including academic aptitude, commitment to an academic career, and the training and service requirements.

43. The NIHR ACF interview evaluation form and guidance may be found in Appendix 5.

44. The following should be remembered when formulating the assessment criteria:
a. NIHR ACFs are intended to offer training to those who can demonstrate outstanding potential for development as a clinical academic in research and/or educational research;

b. The training will require the ACFs to spend 25% of their time undertaking academic training combined with clinical training in the remaining 75%;

c. The expected outcome of an NIHR ACF is the preparation of a successful application for a research training fellowship or educational training programme leading to a higher degree, or if applicable a postdoctoral fellowship; and

d. Progress will be monitored, but in the event that an individual is unsuccessful in obtaining a research training fellowship/place on an educational training programme within three years, they will join a standard clinical training programme.

45. The selection criteria should require applicants to demonstrate:

a. High-level interest in the proposed academic field, backed up if possible by relevant publications, prizes or distinctions;

b. Their potential as a doctoral researcher; and

c. Clarity about longer-term career aspirations and how this Fellowship will provide opportunities for career development.

46. To assess the candidate’s prior research experience, it is essential that the appointment panel have the candidate’s application forms, including publication record, on the day of interview.

The Selection Process

47. Applicants will be assessed against the criteria in the appropriate clinical programme person specification for that specialty as well as against the appropriate academic person specification (Appendix 2). They will be assessed against these in the same interview.

48. Applicants for ACF posts must be deemed clinically ‘good enough’ at their ACF interview(s). To address this a clinical question must be asked at the ACF interview.

49. If academic interview scores are tied, clinical performance at the ACF interview will determine ranking.

Offers: Orthodontics, Paediatric Dentistry, Restorative Dentistry

50. For recruitment to GDC Specialties with a National Recruitment Process, the top ranked applicant at the ACF interview will either be given a non-conditional or conditional offer. Conditional offers will be given to successful applicants at the ACF interviews that do not already hold a NTN in the GDC specialty and level to which they are applying. The condition of the offer relates to clinical benchmarking in the GDC specialty of the ACF post to which they are applying.

Clinical Benchmarking: Orthodontics, Paediatric Dentistry, Restorative Dentistry

51. Clinical benchmarking relates to applicants reaching the threshold of appointability at the national standard clinical interviews/assessments for the GDC specialty and level of ACF post to which they are applying. Only applicants to GDC specialties for which a National Recruitment Process is in place who are successful at the ACF interviews that do not hold an NTN in the GDC specialty to which they are applying need to be clinically benchmarked.
52. Applicants who fail to reach the appointability threshold at clinical benchmarking will be ineligible for appointment to the ACF post in that recruitment round. Under these circumstances the conditional ACF offer will be withdrawn. If applicants require clinical benchmarking, then the HEE Local Office hosting the ACF post will need to ensure that the HEE National Recruitment Team are made aware of this in a timely manner.

53. Applicants who fail clinical benchmarking and become ineligible are still able to reapply in future recruitment rounds.

Appointments

54. Post holders will usually be employed by a NHS Organisation. Details of how the employing partnership will manage the appointment should be agreed with the trainee and each appointment should be managed according to the established practices and needs of local NHS Organisations. It is anticipated that appointments will reflect the principles outlined in the Follett review report of September 2001 (available on request).

Providing Information

55. IAT Partnerships are expected to provide up to date information on these posts. 100% of funding for each post comes from the Department of Health Science, Research and Evidence Directorate R&D budget that is supported directly by funding from the Treasury. Funding arrangements do not now require HEE to part-fund posts, switch funding from standard clinical training posts, or arrange back-fill.

56. It is important that IAT Partnerships provide information on available and filled posts in a timely manner to ensure that applicants and potential applicants can have accurate information.

ACF Appraisals

57. The ARCP should comprise joint academic and clinical appraisal according to Follett principles with assessment according to College and HEE Local Office recommendations for ACFs. A general overview for reviewing the progression of trainees undertaking joint clinical and academic training programmes is provided in the Dental Gold Guide.

58. The Academy of Medical Sciences has formulated supplementary guidelines to aid trainees, supervisors, and assessors in reviewing academic training and progress. These are available at:  
http://www.acmedsci.ac.uk/policy/policy-projects/guidelines-for-monitoring-academic-training-and-progress/

Completion of a NIHR ACF

59. The duration of a NIHR ACF will be for a maximum of 3 years. During this time the trainee combines clinical specialty with academic training which is geared to competing for a training fellowship.

60. When trainees successfully obtain a fellowship, they normally spend 3 years outside of their clinical programme working towards the completion of a PhD (or equivalent). The trainees will need to obtain agreement from their HEE Local Office to take the time out of their clinical programme. This will not normally be refused. Agreement to taking time out of programme will require confirmation from the relevant HEE Local Office that the trainee has achieved relevant clinical competences and is ready to leave the clinical programme, and ideally that the research project has been peer reviewed and approved.
61. On completion of a training fellowship, they will return to the clinical programme and at an appropriate point may competitively apply for a NIHR Clinical Lectureship, subject to availability and provided that appropriate academic and clinical competences have been obtained, or continue in clinical training.

Completion of a NIHR GDP ACF

62. The duration of a NIHR GDP ACF will be for a maximum of 4 years. During this time the trainee combines further clinical training and/or service with academic training which is geared to competing for a training fellowship.

63. When trainees successfully obtain a fellowship, they normally spend 3 years outside of their standard clinical programme working towards the completion of a PhD (or equivalent).

Options for Less Than Full Time (LTFT) working

64. NIHR ACFs comprise 25% academic and 75% clinical training for up to 3 years (up to 4 years for GDPs).

65. LTFT ACFs can be extended up to a maximum of 5 years (up to a maximum of 6 years for GDPs), with a stipulation that the academic component remains at 25% of Full Time Equivalent.

66. Please note, the maximum duration of both full and LTFT ACF posts stated above does not include any periods of statutory leave taken during the post.

Early Exit from Academic Training: NIHR ACFs

67. There are several points at which an ACF may decide, or be advised, to leave the academic training pathway. As long as clinical competencies have been successfully achieved, the dentist would be able to re-join the non-academic speciality training programme, retaining their NTN and relinquishing the (a) suffix. In all instances, it is important to remember that the clinical Programme Director (acting on behalf of the Postgraduate Dental Dean) would have to identify a suitable placement in the clinical programme, and that in some cases this could take up to a year. It is therefore important to give warning to the Postgraduate Dental Dean as soon as the possibility of early exit from the programme is identified. It is hoped that it will not occur but it is possible that the individual leaving the academic career programme might have to wait for a suitable clinical placement while retaining their NTN. During this time, they may have to find other work. To avoid this, it is essential that the trainee gives as much notice as possible of their intentions.

68. Early exit from academic training might occur at the following points:

   a. At the end of the ACF, the fellow may fail for whatever reason to obtain, or may decide not to pursue, a training fellowship award for PhD studies. Academic funding could not be guaranteed to continue beyond 3 years, so as much warning as possible is needed if the fellow wishes to continue in a clinical programme.

   b. After completing a training fellowship and obtaining a PhD (or equivalent), a trainee may decide or be advised not to pursue academic training any further. Hopefully, this decision will have been arrived at over a period of time, so that maximum warning can be given to the HEE Local Office in order to avoid or minimise any wait to re-enter the clinical programme with their NTN.
Early Exit from Academic Training: NIHR GDP ACFs

69. At the end of the 4 year NIHR GDP ACF, the fellow may fail for whatever reason to obtain, or may decide not to pursue, a training fellowship award for PhD studies. In this situation the trainee would return to normal clinical service.

Out of Programme (OOP)

70. No Out of Programme (OOP) activity, other than for statutory reasons, is allowed for NIHR ACFs. Trainees can still apply to the HEE Local Office to go out of programme for other reasons; however, the NIHR ACF post will terminate and they will go into normal clinical training on their return from OOP. Any OOP must also be agreed with the employing organisation.

Guidance about Academic Referees

71. One of the referees for each applicant should be able to advise the recruitment panel of the candidate’s academic strengths and weaknesses. The referee may be someone who has knowledge of the applicant’s skills and attributes from some time ago, e.g. supervisor of an intercalated degree or special study module. It is important, however, that the academic referee carefully considers the suitability of the candidate for a long-term career in academic dentistry. Applicants are expected to discuss their application with the academic referee and to have established that the referee is happy to submit a reference using the Structured Reference Form in Appendix 3.

72. Referees will be asked to comment on:
   a. Their perception of the commitment of the applicant to an academic career;
   b. Academic competencies that they have already developed; and
   c. The potential of the applicant for further development as a clinical academic.

73. Where appropriate and applicable the referee may also comment on the role played by the applicant in any scientific outputs.

Guidance for Completion of Appendix 1: The “Supplementary Questions for Candidates Applying for a NIHR Dental Academic Clinical Fellowship”

74. In addition to the application form please ensure that candidates meet the criteria in the Person Specification for a NIHR ACF and eligibility criteria outlined in Appendix 2. Candidates must also demonstrate the appropriate clinical competences to enter specialty training.

75. Academic Achievement and Professional Qualifications
   
   University(ies) attended
   
   a. Please provide the name of the university or universities that you have attended with dates where you gained your professional or academic qualifications. For each, please name the Department or School where you were based for your study.
**Degree/Diplomas**

b. Please provide all the qualifications that you have achieved which you feel are relevant to your application for a NIHR ACF. Where a class or grade was associated with your qualification, please provide this information. The date and awarding body of your qualification(s) should also be provided. Please note that original certificates will be requested at interview.

**Prizes or other academic distinctions**

c. Please list any prizes or academic distinctions (maximum of six) which you have gained and provide the date of award and the awarding body for each.

76. **Key and Relevant Academic Achievement**

**Research, whether past or in progress**

a. This section gives you the opportunity to explain the research experience you have. Give brief details of the projects with which you have been involved, both past or in progress and include the research methods you have learnt as a result. Please also include a description of your level of involvement and your exact role in the research team. For example, you might have had responsibility for collecting data from or analysing material with two other clinicians. You might have had overall responsibility, within the team, for collating all the data from one method of analysis and you helped write this section of the final publication where you featured as a co-author.

**More detail of one of the research projects**

b. This section provides you with the opportunity to give more detail about one research project and your involvement. You only have 250 words but explain briefly what you feel you learnt from this project in particular.

77. **Aims, Career Objectives and Commitment to a Career in Academic Dentistry**

**Medium- and long-term career goals**

a. Please indicate your medium- and long-term goals in relation to academic dentistry. You might wish to say what you are aiming to be doing in 5 and 10 years’ time.

**Why you want a NIHR ACF**

b. Please explain why you want a NIHR ACF and how it will support your longer-term career aspirations.
Appendix 1: Supplementary Questions for Candidates Applying for a NIHR Dental Academic Clinical Fellowship

**Academic Achievement & Professional Qualifications**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>University(ies) attended. Please also indicate the Department or School.</th>
<th>Dates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Shortlisted candidates will be required to bring original certificates to the interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Degree/Diploma (include BSc, BDS, BChD, MBBS, MSc, MB/PhD, PhD, MD or equivalent)</th>
<th>Awarding Body</th>
<th>Dates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prizes and other academic distinctions</th>
<th>Awarding Body</th>
<th>Dates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key & Relevant Academic Achievement**

Research, whether past or in progress. Please give brief details of all research projects and/or relevant research experience that you have undertaken or are undertaking, including methods used. Indicate your level of involvement and your exact role in the research team.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Please describe in more detail one of the research projects highlighted above (Up to 250 words).</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aims, Career Objectives, and Commitment to a Career in Academic Dentistry</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Please indicate your medium and long-term career goals in relation to an academic career.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Please say why you want a NIHR Academic Clinical Fellowship. Explain how the hosting research department will support your research aims and career objectives.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
## Appendix 2: Supplementary Person Specification for Candidates Applying for a NIHR Dental Academic Clinical Fellowship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ESSENTIAL</th>
<th>DESIRABLE</th>
<th>WHEN EVALUATED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ELIGIBILITY</strong></td>
<td>• Evidence of achievement of general professional competencies</td>
<td>• Evidence of commitment to specialty</td>
<td>Application Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Completion of Foundation Training and Dental Core Training Year 1 (or equivalent) by time of appointment, as appropriate</td>
<td>• Intercalated honours for BSc and/or additional qualifications e.g. MSc etc.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Evidence of commitment to specialty</td>
<td>• Distinction or honours during BDS programme</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Intercalated honours for BSc and/or additional qualifications e.g. MSc etc.</td>
<td>• Completion of Academic programme or equivalent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>KNOWLEDGE &amp; ACHIEVEMENTS</strong></td>
<td>• Demonstration of acquiring the level of knowledge and skills necessary for completion of general professional training with an emphasis on academic competencies</td>
<td>• Demonstration of good general knowledge/ broad interest in science and academic dentistry</td>
<td>Application Form and interview/selection centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Demonstration of understanding of, and commitment to, an academic career</td>
<td>• Prizes or distinctions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Demonstration of understanding of, and commitment to, an academic career</td>
<td>• Presentation of work at a national or international meeting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Demonstration of understanding of, and commitment to, an academic career</td>
<td>• Publications in peer reviewed journals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Demonstration of understanding of, and commitment to, an academic career</td>
<td>• Intercalated degree or MSc in relevant subject area</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Research experience</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Demonstration of knowledge of the clinical academic career pathway</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EDUCATIONAL &amp; PERSONAL ASPECTS</strong></td>
<td>• Demonstration of understanding and commitment to academic career</td>
<td>• Demonstration of educational reasons for applying for this Academic Clinical Fellowship Programme</td>
<td>Application Form and interview/selection centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Demonstration of personal reasons for applying for this Academic Clinical Fellowship Programme</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>COMMUNICATION SKILLS</strong></td>
<td>• As for standard person specification criteria</td>
<td>• Evidence of team working skills</td>
<td>Application Form and interview/selection centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Evidence of leadership potential</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Evidence through scientific publications and presentations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please note: Candidates with relevant higher degrees are eligible for this scheme.
Appendix 3: Structured Reference Form

For applications to Specialty Training Programmes and Academic Training Programmes.

The individual to whom this reference refers has applied for a specialty training placement and has given your name as a referee and we would be grateful if you could provide us with information required below. Please note we can only accept references on this structured reference form. This professional reference should verify factual information only; we do not require you to provide a personal testimonial or an assessment of the candidate. Your responses may be discussed with the applicant named above and/or his/her trainer. Your reference may also be made available to other departments within the NHS.

This reference form has been developed with the General Medical Council publication “Good Medical Practice” in mind. Your attention is drawn to the following paragraph:

“When providing references for colleagues, your comments must be honest and justifiable; you must include all relevant information which has a bearing on the colleague’s competence, performance, reliability and conduct” (GMC Good Medical Practice, Second Edition, July 1998 – The duties of a doctor registered with the General Medical Council, Item 11 – References.).

Candidates applying for academic posts must have one academic referee. The academic referee must complete all the academic sections, and as many of the other sections as possible. The referee may be someone who has knowledge of the candidate’s skills and attributes from some time ago, e.g. supervisor of an intercalated degree or special study module. It is important however that the academic referee carefully considers the suitability of the candidate for a long term career in academic dentistry. Applicants are expected to discuss their application with the academic referee and to have established that the referee is happy to submit a reference. Information supplied by the academic referee may be considered by the committee conducting the interview.

Applicant Name:

Applicant GMC/GDC No

Applicant Ref No

Post Applied For:

Please confirm the applicant’s employment details that are covered by this reference:

Date started: Date finished:

Position held by applicant:

(level and specialty)

Level / grade:

Specialty:

Trust name/location:

Your relationship to applicant:

Clinical Supervisor ☐

Educational Supervisor ☐

Other (please specify) ☐

Was their attendance/timekeeping satisfactory?

YES ☐ NO ☐ If No, please give details:

Was the applicant subject to any disciplinary procedure, formal or otherwise, during their time with you?

YES ☐ NO ☐ If Yes, please give details:
The post applied for is exempt from the provision of section 4 (2) of the Rehabilitation of Offenders Act 1974 (exceptions order 1975). Under this order are you aware of any criminal convictions or cautions which may affect the applicant’s suitability for the post?*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES □</th>
<th>NO □</th>
<th>If Yes, please give details:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

*It is contrary to the Act for referees not to reveal any information they may have, concerning convictions which may otherwise be considered “spent” in relation to this application which you consider relevant to the applicant’s suitability for employment.

Would you be happy to work with this individual again? | YES □ | NO □ |
---|---|---|
Are you able to recommend this applicant for the post they have applied for? | YES □ | NO □ |

If you have any other comments regarding this applicant and his/her application for this post, please give details here:

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SIGNATURE</th>
<th>NAME (print in block capitals)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>POSITION HELD</td>
<td>CONTACT TELEPHONE NO.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of hospital or training practice</td>
<td>E-MAIL ADDRESS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your UK GMC/GDC Number</td>
<td>If NOT registered with the UK GMC/GDC: Give name of your registering body &amp; Your Registration Number:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full Postal Address</td>
<td>If not registered with the UK GMC/GDC please attach photocopy evidence of your professional status to this reference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DATE (dd/mm/yyyy)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is essential that this form is stamped with an official hospital stamp. If no stamp is available, please attach a compliment slip signed by the consultant providing the reference. Forms received without a stamp or a signed compliment slip will be returned.

Official hospital stamp (or training practice stamp)

Thank you for completing this reference. This form should be handed back to the applicant in a sealed envelope. If you have returned the completed form by e-mail, please ensure that a paper copy is returned by post.
**Academic candidate section:** (Academic referees must complete this section. Clinical referees may be in a position to complete this section if supplying a reference for a candidate applying for an academic post).

**Knowledge and achievements** - Demonstrates general knowledge / broad interest in science and academic dentistry.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Below average knowledge in science and academic dentistry</td>
<td>Average knowledge in science and academic dentistry</td>
<td>Good knowledge in science and academic dentistry</td>
<td>Excellent knowledge in science and academic dentistry</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments / evidence:

**Commitment to an academic career** - Demonstration of understanding and commitment to academic career.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Has shown no interest in an academic career</td>
<td>Limited interest in an academic career</td>
<td>Positive interest in an academic career</td>
<td>Actively seeking out academic opportunities for future career</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments / evidence:

**Academic potential** - Demonstrates potential for a career in education / research through scientific publications and presentations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No evidence of participation in audit, teaching or research</td>
<td>Some evidence of participation in audit, teaching or research</td>
<td>Active participation in audit, teaching or research</td>
<td>Leading role for audit, teaching or research</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments / evidence:

**Academic potential** – Potential to innovate by creating new ideas and influencing others.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fails to generate ideas or solutions that are accepted by others</td>
<td>Generates new ideas and solutions with mixed results</td>
<td>Generates new ideas and solutions with mainly positive results on the team</td>
<td>Generates new ideas and solutions that have a positive impact on the team</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments / evidence:
Appendix 4: Shortlisting Scoresheet

To the applicant: this shows the scoring system to be used for short-listing from the application form. If the short-listing panel agrees that you have scored “0” in any of the essential criteria this means that you have not provided sufficient evidence to demonstrate the attribute. You therefore cannot be short listed. You are advised to self-assess yourself prior to application and to seek advice from your educational supervisor if necessary. This should not be returned with your application. It is for your information only.

---

**NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR HEALTH RESEARCH AND THE XXXXXXXX HEE Local Office**

**SHORTLISTING SCORE SHEET – ACADEMIC CLINICAL FELLOW IN SPECIALTY – LEVEL**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENTRY CRITERIA</th>
<th>Assessed In Section</th>
<th>YES/NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eligible for registration with the GDC</td>
<td>Part 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BDS (or equivalent)</td>
<td>Part 2 Section 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Success in RELEVANT EXAM examination (or equivalent)</td>
<td>Part 2 Section 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achievement of Foundation and Dental Core Training competences by post start date</td>
<td>Part 2 Section 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least 24 months’ experience (at SHO level) in this specialty (not including Foundation modules) by post start date</td>
<td>Part 2 Section 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ESSENTIAL CRITERIA</th>
<th>YES / NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Has this applicant scored a 0 in any of the essential criteria?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If an applicant scores 0 in any of the essential criteria, the application must be discussed at the short listing committee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

To the Shortlister: Please complete the scoresheet in full and total up the points for each section, noting them in the boxes on each page. Please then add the totals and enter in the area below. Please read the supplemental notes on the final page before marking the application.

Total number of points scored (Maximum = 36): ______

Signed: ____________________________

Date: ____________________________
## Essential Selection Criteria – Academic Clinical Fellowship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>0 points</th>
<th>1 point</th>
<th>2 points</th>
<th>3 points</th>
<th>4 points</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Clinical experience</td>
<td>No evidence of relevant clinical experience</td>
<td>Evidence of minimum relevant clinical experience</td>
<td>Evidence of average relevant clinical experience</td>
<td>Evidence of above average clinical experience</td>
<td>/3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/3</td>
<td>Academic experience</td>
<td>No evidence of relevant academic experience</td>
<td>Evidence of minimum relevant academic experience</td>
<td>Evidence of average relevant academic experience</td>
<td>Evidence of above average academic experience</td>
<td>/3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/3</td>
<td>Commitment to a clinical academic career</td>
<td>No evidence of commitment to this career path</td>
<td>Weak evidence of commitment to this career path</td>
<td>Limited but clear evidence of commitment to this career path</td>
<td>Ample and clear evidence of commitment</td>
<td>/4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whole form</td>
<td>Language Skills</td>
<td>No evidence of competence in written English</td>
<td>Demonstrates competence in and reasonable use of written English</td>
<td>Clear and concise use of appropriate written English</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whole Form</td>
<td>Reasoned / Analytical Approach</td>
<td>No evidence of reasoned / analytical approach to applying for the post in completing form</td>
<td>Provides some evidence relevant to clinical academic training, linked to position applied for</td>
<td>Provides evidence throughout of reasons for applying, and clearly links experience to the post being applied for</td>
<td>/2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total for essential criteria (Maximum = 14)**

### Note to Shortlisters: Desirable selection criteria

In order to ensure the most appropriate allocation of marks, Shortlisters should take into account the stage of the applicant’s career at which they are applying, and - where a specific entry level has been assigned to the Academic Clinical Fellowship applied for - the appropriateness of their academic career progression to the level of training. This is particularly important in relation to criteria relating to Section 3 of the application form.

The aggregate score for desirable criteria should be regarded as indicative rather than absolute in the shortlisting process. For instance, one applicant may achieve a higher total score than another candidate because they are further on in their career. However, the more junior applicant may demonstrate more potential despite the lower level of overall achievement.

Shortlisters should, therefore, take account of the profile of the desirable criteria in the context of the level of application, together with the essential criteria results, in reaching their decisions. In all cases, marks awarded and decisions should be based on the evidence provided by the applicant.
## Desirable Selection Criteria: Academic Clinical Fellowship

**SHORTLISTERS PLEASE SEE IMPORTANT NOTE ABOVE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>0 points</th>
<th>1 point</th>
<th>2 points</th>
<th>3 points</th>
<th>4 points</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3A</td>
<td>BSc or BA OR MSC or MRes OR PhD or MD in relevant subject (Mark one only)</td>
<td>None None None None (Mark one only)</td>
<td>None None None None (Mark one only)</td>
<td>2:1 In progress In progress (Mark one only)</td>
<td>1st Class Awarded Awarded (Mark one only)</td>
<td></td>
<td>/3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3A</td>
<td>Undergraduate or postgraduate prizes</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>One or more</td>
<td>Three or more OR 1 highly prestigious e.g. University Gold Medal</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3A</td>
<td>Honors' / distinctions (in final MB)</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>One or more</td>
<td>Three or more</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3D</td>
<td>Teaching experience</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Regular participation</td>
<td>Formal teaching role</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3B/F/G/I</td>
<td>Extra-curricular activities</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Activities relevant to clinical academic career</td>
<td>Activities relevant to clinical academic career in this specialty</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3C</td>
<td>Scientific publications</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Evidence of good quality publication as a co-author</td>
<td>Evidence of several good quality publications as a co-author or evidence of good quality publication as a major contributor (e.g. first author)</td>
<td>Evidence of more than 1 publication in a leading specialty journal or major journal inc publication as a major contributor (e.g. first author)</td>
<td>Four or more as a major contributor (e.g. first author) including at least 1 one in a leading journal for the specialty or other major journal</td>
<td>/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3C</td>
<td>Scientific presentations at National/International Level</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Evidence limited</td>
<td>Evidence ample</td>
<td>Evidence outstanding</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>/3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Key academic achievements</td>
<td>No evidence of academic potential</td>
<td>Evidence weak</td>
<td>Evidence limited</td>
<td>Evidence ample</td>
<td>Evidence outstanding</td>
<td>/4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total for desirable criteria (Maximum = 22)**
## Appendix 5: Structured Interview Evaluation Form

### SPECIALTY ACADEMIC CLINICAL FELLOWSHIP (SUPPLEMENT)

### INSTRUCTIONS:

The interview contains 3 question areas. The interview should be longer than 30 minutes. We recommend that one interviewer records the candidate responses.

The question areas to be addressed are directly linked to the Person Specification. Each question area should be covered in turn. Interviewer 1 asks the questions while the candidate responses are recorded by interviewer 2.

Candidate responses should be written into the boxes provided.

Ensure that this report form has the candidate’s name recorded and the date and time of the interview.

The indicators on this Interview Scoring Form should be used in rating the candidate responses on a 5-point scale (see below). You may find it useful to tick indicator boxes accordingly, as indicators are displayed during the interview.

The following scale should be used to determine a score for each question area.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NE</th>
<th>No evidence</th>
<th>• No evidence reported</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Areas for Concern</td>
<td>• Limited number of specified positive behavioural indicators displayed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Many negative indicators displayed, <em>one or more decisively</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Satisfactory</td>
<td>• Satisfactory display of specified positive behavioural indicators</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Some negative indicators displayed, <em>but not clearly and decisively</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Good</td>
<td>• Good display of specified positive behavioural indicators</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Few negative indicators displayed, <em>but not clearly and decisively</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Excellent</td>
<td>• Excellent display of specified positive behavioural indicators (and possibly others)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Little or no negative indicators displayed, and these considered minor in status</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2018 NIHR ACF (Dental) Interview Evaluation Form Body

## Academic Supplement: ____________ Applicant Name: ____________

### QUESTION SET 1 (KNOWLEDGE & ACHIEVEMENTS)

Demonstrates acquisition of the level of knowledge and skills necessary for the completion of DCT with an emphasis on academic competencies

Demonstrates general knowledge / broad interest in science and academic dentistry & knowledge of the clinical career pathway

### POSITIVE INDICATORS

- Provides clear and reasoned explanation for importance of academic dentistry
- Shows accurate understanding of purpose and impact of academic dentistry
- Shows awareness of basic principles of research methodology
- Provides evidence of personal experience of research

### NEGATIVE INDICATORS

- Explanations / arguments are unclear or lack relevance
- Lacks understanding of purpose and impact of academic dentistry
- Provides no evidence of personal experience of research or understanding of research methodology
- Unable to link own experience to their arguments

### NOTES TO JUSTIFY RATING

**RATING**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>NE</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### QUESTION SET 2 (SCIENTIFIC PUBLICATIONS AND PRESENTATIONS)

Demonstrates clear career intentions as a clinical academic

Demonsrates experience in research / publications / presentations

Demonstrates potential for a career in educational / research through scientific publications and presentations

### POSITIVE INDICATORS

- Provides evidence of academic potential through presentations / publications / prizes and honours
- Clear understanding of how research experience can contribute to development of a career as a clinical academic
- Shows how research interests are relevant to the Academic Clinical Fellowship in this specialty

### NEGATIVE INDICATORS

- Explanation of academic activities lacks clarity or relevance
- Lacks understanding of how his/her experience can be built on in development of a career as a clinical academic
- Fails to explain how own research interests can be aligned with the specialty

### NOTES TO JUSTIFY RATING

**RATING**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>NE</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### QUESTION SET 3 (COMMUNICATION SKILLS)

Demonstrates clarity in written and spoken communication and capacity to adapt language as appropriate to the situation

Able to build rapport, listen, persuade and negotiate

Demonstrates evidence of team working skills, leadership potential

### POSITIVE INDICATORS

- Adjusts to style of questioning / responses as appropriate
- Able to express ideas to others clearly – written and spoken
- Uses inventive language (e.g. humour / analogy) to explain
- Uses active listening
- Makes effective use of non-verbal behaviour (voice, posture etc)

### NEGATIVE INDICATORS

- Unable to adapt language / behaviour as needed
- Is patronising / domineering in communicating with others
- Use of language is too functional/narrow/technical
- Limited evidence of active listening
- Fails to engage others at non-verbal level

### NOTES TO JUSTIFY RATING

**RATING**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>NE</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Panel Member Name: ........................................ Date:..............................